

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA**

FELISHATAY ALVARADO,
Plaintiff,

v.

CITY OF PHILADLEPHIA, et al.,
Defendants.

**Civil Action
No. 22-3763**

VERDICT SHEET

I. Constitutional claims against individual SWAT Unit Officer defendants Joshua Burkitt, Eric Clark, Kevin Mellody, Brian Murray, Patrick Saba, Demtrius Monk, Edward Song, and Jose Hamoy

Entry

1. Do you find that Felishatay Alvarado has proven by a preponderance of the evidence that the following individual SWAT Unit Officers unreasonably entered her residence and violated her Fourth Amendment right to be free from unreasonable search?

Joshua Burkitt	YES	<u>✓</u>	NO	<u> </u>
Eric Clark	YES	<u>✓</u>	NO	<u> </u>
Kevin Mellody	YES	<u>✓</u>	NO	<u> </u>
Brian Murray	YES	<u>✓</u>	NO	<u> </u>
Patrick Saba	YES	<u>✓</u>	NO	<u> </u>
Demetrius Monk	YES	<u>✓</u>	NO	<u> </u>
Edward Song	YES	<u>✓</u>	NO	<u> </u>
Jose Hamoy	YES	<u>✓</u>	NO	<u> </u>

Proceed to Question 2 (next page)

Seizure

2. Do you find that Felishatay Alvarado has proven by a preponderance of the evidence that the following individual SWAT Unit Officers unreasonably seized her and violated her Fourth Amendment right to be free from unreasonable seizure?

Joshua Burkitt	YES	_____	NO	_____✓
Eric Clark	YES	_____	NO	_____✓
Kevin Mellody	YES	_____	NO	_____✓
Brian Murray	YES	_____	NO	_____✓
Patrick Saba	YES	_____	NO	_____✓
Demetrius Monk	YES	_____	NO	_____✓
Edward Song	YES	_____	NO	_____✓
Jose Hamoy	YES	_____	NO	_____✓

If you answered "Yes" anywhere in questions 1 or 2, then proceed to SWAT Unit Officer damages, question 3 (next page)

If you answered "No" as to every individual SWAT Unit Officer in questions 1 and 2, then skip questions 3, 4, and 5, and proceed directly to question 6 (page 6)

SWAT Unit Officer Compensatory Damages

3. Please state the amount of compensatory damages, if any, that Felishatay Alvarado has proven by a preponderance of the evidence that will compensate her for any and all injuries she sustained due to the conduct of the SWAT Unit Officers you found liable.

Joshua Burkitt	\$ <u>0</u>
Eric Clark	\$ <u>0</u>
Kevin Mellody	\$ <u>0</u>
Brian Murray	\$ <u>0</u>
Patrick Saba	\$ <u>0</u>
Demetrius Monk	\$ <u>0</u>
Edward Song	\$ <u>0</u>
Jose Hamoy	\$ <u>0</u>
Total	\$ <u>0</u>

Proceed to Question 4 (next page)

SWAT Unit Officer Punitive Damages

4. Do you find that the following individual SWAT Unit Officers acted maliciously or wantonly against Felishatay Alvarado under the facts found by you?

Joshua Burkitt	YES	_____	NO	_____✓
Eric Clark	YES	_____	NO	_____✓
Kevin Mellody	YES	_____	NO	_____✓
Brian Murray	YES	_____	NO	_____✓
Patrick Saba	YES	_____	NO	_____✓
Demetrius Monk	YES	_____	NO	_____✓
Edward Song	YES	_____	NO	_____✓
Jose Hamoy	YES	_____	NO	_____✓

If you answered "Yes" for any individual SWAT Unit Officers in the above question, then proceed to question 5 (next page).

If you answered "No" as to every individual SWAT Unit Officer in the above question, then skip question 5, and proceed directly to question 6 (page 6).

5. Do you award punitive damages against the following individual Defendants for whom you answered "Yes," above?

Joshua Burkitt

YES _____

NO

☒

If yes, in what amount? \$ _____

Eric Clark

YES _____

NO

☒

If yes, in what amount? \$ _____

Kevin Mellody

YES _____

NO

☒

If yes, in what amount? \$ _____

Brian Murray

YES _____

NO

☒

If yes, in what amount? \$ _____

Patrick Saba

YES _____

NO

☒

If yes, in what amount? \$ _____

Demetrius Monk

YES _____

NO

☒

If yes, in what amount? \$ _____

Edward Song

YES _____

NO

☒

If yes, in what amount? \$ _____

Jose Hamoy

YES _____

NO

☒

If yes, in what amount? \$ _____

Proceed to question 6 (next page).

II. Constitutional Claims Against Defendant City of Philadelphia

Liability

6. Do you find Felishatay Alvarado proved, by a preponderance of the evidence, that the City of Philadelphia failed to adequately train its SWAT Unit Officers in a specifically identified way that amounted to deliberate indifference and that failure was the moving force behind a violation of her Fourth Amendment right to be free from unreasonable search and seizure?

YES

☒

NO

☐

If your answer to the above question is "Yes," then proceed to question 7 below.

If your answer to the above question is "No," then skip question 7, and proceed directly to the signature section below.


Compensatory Damages

7. Please state the amount of compensatory damages, if any, that Felishatay Alvarado has proven by a preponderance of the evidence that will compensate her for any and all injuries she sustained due to the City of Philadelphia's failure to adequately train its SWAT Unit Officers.

\$ 1,000,143.50

Signature

This is our true verdict, **SO SAY WE ALL**, this 27 day of September, 2024.



Foreperson

PLEASE HAVE THE FOREPERSON SIGN THE VERDICT SHEET AND NOTIFY THE COURT DEPUTY THAT YOU HAVE COMPLETED YOUR DELIBERATIONS.